

Perceptions of Stakeholders on Recruitment Process in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria

¹Muhammad Musa Ibrahim, ^{*2}Ummi Haruna Tijjani and ³Yusuf Bala Audi

¹Department of Educational Foundations and Curriculum Faculty of Education, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria – Nigeria. **Email:** musabraheem01@gmail.com

^{*2}Department of Educational Foundations and Curriculum Faculty of Education, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria – Nigeria. **Email:** ummitijjaniharuna@gmail.com

³Department of Educational Foundations and Curriculum, Faculty of Education, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Kaduna State, Nigeria. **Email:** asfasunnah21@gmail.com

Abstract

This study assessed “Perceptions of Stakeholders on Recruitment Process in Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria”. Descriptive survey research design was used for the study. The population of the study was 606 respondents. This comprises of 324 Civil Service Commission (CSC) staff, 154 Planning Research and Statistics (PRS) Staff and 128 Human Resources/Personnel Management Department (HRM) Staff from the States Ministries of Education in North-West Zone, Nigeria. The sample of the study was 234 respondents. Proportionate stratified sampling technique was used for the study. Three (3) experts vet the instrument and the reliability index yielded 0.82 using Cronbach’s Alpha Method. Mean score was used to answer the research questions while One-Way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) was used to test the hypotheses formulated at the 0.05 significance level. Findings of the study revealed that deadlines for applications were clearly stated, but applicants do not receive timely updates on the status of their applications from the Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria. The study recommended that State Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria should ensure that applicants receive timely updates on the status of their applications from the Ministries.

Keywords: Recruitment Process, Application Procedure, Selection Process

Introduction

In the era of far-reaching information and action, every organization consistently aspires to the advancement and growth of its business operations and practices. Hence, it is imperative for the organizational managers to proactively anticipate potential advancements and growth, while concurrently ensuring the comprehensive staffing of all vacant positions with qualified personnel. This meticulous approach, in the opinion of Ahmad and Nur (2023), is essential to facilitate the seamless and efficient functioning of all organizational activities within the institution. The success of organizations to obtain quality human resources is through the recruitment process, since in this way, they can choose the best number of workers (human resource) from the many prospective applicants to be employed in their organizations.

Over the years, different definitions have been given to describe the term “Recruitment”. For instance, Okoro and Ndema (2023) defined recruitment as the overall process of identifying, sourcing, screening, short listing and interviewing candidates for jobs. It is the process of discovering reliable sources of contacting desirable employees which meets the staffing requirements. According to Ahmad and Nur (2023), recruitment process refers to the systematic approach undertaken by organizations to acquire additional human resources. Recruitment is the process of generating a pool of capable candidates applying to an organisation for employment (Gold & Bratton, 2021). Yusuf (2018) viewed recruitment as the processes of identifying and attracting potential candidates from within and outside the organization to begin evaluating them for future employment. In line with this definition, Oaya et al (2017) also defined recruitment as the discovering of potential candidates for actual or anticipated organizational vacancies.

Application procedure is an important stage in an idea recruitment process. According to Oyadiran et al (2023), application is a document prepared by job candidates to express their interest in a certain position. The candidate's name, age, sex, qualifications, expertise, religion, hobby, location, contact address, and recommendations are among the details supplied in an application form. The quality of human resource in an organization highly depends on the quality of applicants attracted because organization is going to select employees from those who were attracted. Poor application procedures can send the incorrect message to successful applicants, who may arrive at work

with a poor opinion of the organization. Therefore, the expectation is that the recruitment process should be consistent with peculiar characteristics of the organization, and most importantly, the overall organisational strategy, vision, and values that will attract competent personnel for optimum performance. Using the correct recruiting procedures, state ministries of education can ensure that the applicants have the necessary abilities for the position and the personality to fit into the organization's culture.

Selection is the critical stage of matching employee's competences with organization's goals and culture (Edih et al; 2022). It is the process of choosing from a group of applicants those individuals best suited for a particular position in an organization. Okoro and Ndema (2023) defined selection as a process of choosing suitable applicants from the shortlisted candidates. It is an activity to boost the candidate pool. Muna et al (2020) viewed selection as the systematic procedure of choosing a potential individual to fill up a vacant position. Munaty and Setiasih (2022) described selection as a process or an effort to decide whether an applicant is accepted or not, starting from an application, interview, medical evaluation, and a decision to accept or not. The selection of candidates for a position should be driven by the job specifications that have been established. Recruiting a large number of individuals is simple, but choosing the best among them may be difficult. In the present era of political dispensation, selecting the right applicant can be a difficult task, but at the end of the day, the ministry's reputation is held by the people it employs.

In Nigeria, the State Ministries of Education are in charge of management of educational activities in the states. More often than not, they collaborate with State Civil Service Commissions and Office of Head of Service in recruitment process of best candidates based on the vacant positions of the work force of specializations needed by the ministries. For effective service delivery of educational activities in the country, there is need for professionals and qualified personnel in the field of educational programmes. This can only be achieved when the qualified staff are recruited by state ministries of education in line with the procedure and practices of recruitment. Ministries of Education should persist in prioritizing the enhancement of the recruiting process's quality and efficiency to facilitate improved employee performance in subsequent periods. Implementation of a well-defined and rigorous

recruitment policy is vital to ensure that the ministries exclusively attracts and hires the most exceptional personnel.

Recruitment processes in ministries of education should aim to identify unsuitable applications and concentrate their resources on individuals who are more likely to be recruited. It should possess the potential to cultivate a positive public perception through their ability to shape the attitudes of prospective candidates, regardless of their ultimate appointment status. In the era of information and action, identifying personnel can be a straightforward task; however, identifying individuals who are well-suited to their assigned responsibilities presents a more challenging endeavor. Failure to address the issue of recruitment within ministry of education can lead to decreased effectiveness and efficiency, and in certain cases, result in financial losses and ultimate failure. It is therefore imperative to look into the way recruitment process are been conducted in ministries of education so as to enhance effective management of resource towards the achievement of goals.

Objectives of the Study

The following objectives were raised to guide the study, is to:

- i. examine the perceptions of stakeholders on application procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria;
- ii. determine the perceptions of stakeholders on selection process in State Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria;

Research Questions

The following questions were raised to guide the study:

- i. How do stakeholders perceive application procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria?
- ii. How do stakeholders perceive selection process in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria?

Hypotheses

The following hypotheses were formulated to guide the study:

HO₁: There is no significant difference in the perceptions of respondents on the Application Procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria.

HO₂: There is no significant difference in the perceptions of respondents on the Selection Process in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria.

Methodology

Descriptive survey research design was used for the study. This design, according to Charles and Aligba (2017), is concerned with conditions or relationships that exist, opinions that are held, processes that are going on, effects that are evident or trends that are developing. The population of the study was 606 respondents. This comprises of 324 Civil Service Commission (CSC) staff, 154 Planning Research and Statistics (PRS) Staff and 128 Human Resources/Personnel Management Department (HRM) Staff from the States Ministries of Education in North-West Zone, Nigeria. The sample of the study was 234 respondents were used as sample size for the study based on the recommendation of Researcher Advisors (2006) Table for selection of sample size. Proportionate stratified sampling technique was used for the study.

A self-designed questionnaire of twenty (20) items tagged “Recruitment Process in State Ministries of Education Questionnaire (REPSMEQ)” was used to collect data for the study. The instrument was structured on a five (5) points Likert scale options of Strongly Agree (SA), Agree (A), Undecided (U), Disagree (D) and Strongly Disagree (SD) with the numerical values of 5, 4, 3, 2 and 1 respectively. Three (3) experts from the Department of Educational Foundations and Curriculum, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria vet the instrument and their observations were incorporated in the final draft of the instrument. The instrument reliability index yielded 0.82 using Cronbach’s Alpha Method.

Descriptive statistics of mean was used to answer the research questions. By this, when the mean score of an item was higher than 3.00 set for the study, the item was regarded as agreed by majority of the respondents. On the other hand, when the mean score of an item was lower than 3.00, the item was considered disagreed by majority of the respondents. Independent t-test was used to test the two (2) formulated null hypotheses at the 0.05 level of

significance. By this, when the probability value was lower than 0.05 level of significance set for the study, the hypothesis was rejected, but when the probability value was equal or higher than the level of significance, the hypothesis was retained. A total of 234 copies of the questionnaire were distributed but only 209 (90%) copies were returned. The analysis of the study was based on the data gathered from the above mentioned number of returned copies of questionnaire.

Results

Research Question One: How do stakeholders perceive application procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria?

Table 1: Perceptions of Stakeholders on Application Procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria

S/ N	Item Statement	Categories of Respondent s	SA		A		U		D		SD		M
			F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	
1	Application forms are readily available to applicants in the Ministry.	CSC Staff	1	9.9	43	38.	6	5.4	5	45.	0	0	3.1
			1		7		1	9					3
		PRS Staff	1	18.	17	32.	1	1.9	2	45.	1	1.9	3.2
			0	9	1			4	3			1	
		HRM Staff	1	24.	17	37.	1	2.2	1	35.	0	0	3.5
			1	4	8			6	6			1	
2	The Ministry acknowledges all application letters as a sign of seriousness on its part.	CSC Staff	2	1.8	13	11.	6	5.4	8	80.	1	0.9	2.3
					7		9	2					3
		PRS Staff	2	3.8	7	13.	2	3.8	4	79.	0	0	2.4
					2			2	2			2	
		HRM Staff	0	0	8	17.	3	6.7	3	75.	0	0	2.4
					8			4	6			2	
3	The Ministry provides clear guidelines for completing applications.	CSC Staff	1	15.	32	28.	1	6.9	6	55.	0	0	3.0
					7	3	8		1	0			5
		PRS Staff	8	15.	18	34.	0	0	2	50.	0	0	3.1
					1			7	9			3	
		HRM Staff	4	8.9	15	33.	1	2.2	2	53.	1	2.2	2.9
					3			4	3			3	
4	Deadlines for applications are clearly stated.	CSC Staff	4	43.	39	35.	8	7.2	1	14.	0	0	4.0
					8	2	1		6	4			7
		PRS Staff	1	30.	20	37.	1	18.	7	13.	0	0	3.8
			6	2	7	0	9		2			5	
		HRM Staff	1	35.	18	40.	3	6.7	7	15.	1	2.2	3.9
			6	6	0			6				1	
5	Applicants are informed if their applications are incomplete.	CSC Staff	9	8.1	23	20.	8	7.2	6	57.	7	6.3	2.6
					7		4	7					7
		PRS Staff	4	7.5	13	24.	4	7.5	3	58.	1	1.9	2.7
					5			1	5			7	
		HRM Staff	5	11.	12	26.	1	2.2	2	53.	3	6.7	2.8
					1		7		4	3		2	

6	Applicants receive timely updates on the status of their applications from the Ministry.	CSC Staff	8	7.2	34	30.	1	0.9	6	59.	2	1.8	2.8
		PRC Staff	5	9.4	14	26.	1	1.9	3	56.	3	5.7	2.7
		HRM Staff	5	11.	13	28.	0	0	2	55.	2	4.4	2.8
7	Physical submission points are accessible and adequate.	CSC Staff	2	24.	60	54.	8	7.2	1	14.	0	0	3.8
		PRC Staff	1	30.	30	56.	0	0	7	13.	0	0	4.0
		HRM Staff	1	26.	25	55.	1	2.2	6	13.	1	2.2	3.9
8	The application process is fair and unbiased for all applicants.	CSC Staff	2	21.	49	44.	8	7.2	3	27.	0	0	3.6
		PRC Staff	1	22.	22	41.	3	5.7	1	30.	0	0	3.5
		HRM Staff	1	22.	21	46.	4	8.9	9	20.	1	2.2	3.6
9	The Ministry monitors and reviews its application procedures regularly.	CSC Staff	2	20.	53	47.	7	6.3	2	25.	0	0	3.6
		PRC Staff	1	35.	20	37.	1	1.9	1	24.	0	0	3.8
		HRM Staff	1	37.	19	42.	0	0	8	17.	1	2.2	3.9
10	Applicants feel confident about the security of their personal information.	CSC Staff	2	19.	48	43.	9	8.1	3	27.	1	0.9	3.4
		PRC Staff	1	20.	22	41.	2	3.8	1	32.	1	1.9	3.4
		HRM Staff	1	35.	20	44.	2	4.4	7	15.	0	0	4.0
Grand Mean			6	6	4				6				3.3

Table 1 shows the perceptions of stakeholders on application procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West Nigeria. It revealed that all the items except item 2, 5 and 6 were all agreed upon as ways stakeholders perceived application procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria. This was because they had response mean score higher than the instrument scale mean of 3.00. With the grand mean of 3.33 which is higher than the instrument mean of 3.00, this shows that majority of the respondents agreed that deadlines for applications were clearly stated, but applicants do not receive timely updates on the status of their applications from the Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria.

Research Question Two: How do stakeholders perceive selection process in State Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria?

Table 2: Perceptions of Stakeholders on Selection Process in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria

S/N	Item Statement	Categories of Respondents	SA		A		U		D		SD		M	
			F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%		
1	There is clear framework for conducting staff selection in the Ministry of Education.	CSC Staff	2	19.	33	29.	3	2.7	4	44.	4	3.6	3.1	
			2	8		7			9	1			8	
		PRS Staff	1	18.	13	24.	2	3.8	2	50.	1	1.9	3.0	
			0	9		5			7	9			8	
2	Experience of applicant is considered in staff selection in Ministry of Education.	HRM Staff	1	26.	17	37.	1	2.2	1	13.	0	0	3.5	
			2	7		8			5	3			8	
		CSC Staff	7	6.3	19	17.	4	3.6	5	52.	2	20.	2.3	
					1				8	3		3	7	6
3	Ministry of Education select staff based on area of specialization.	PRS Staff	7	13.	8	15.	1	1.9	2	45.	1	24.	2.4	
			2		1				4	5		3	5	7
		HRM Staff	4	8.9	9	20.	1	2.2	2	53.	7	15.	2.5	
					0				4	3		6	3	
4	There is transparency in the short listing of job candidates in the Ministry.	CSC Staff	1	14.	26	23.	4	3.6	6	54.	5	4.5	2.8	
			6	4		4			0	1			9	
		PRS Staff	7	13.	12	22.	1	1.9	3	56.	3	5.7	2.8	
			2		6				0	6			1	
5	Only candidates with the relevant knowledge are considered during the selection process.	HRM Staff	7	15.	15	33.	1	2.2	2	44.	2	4.4	3.1	
			6		3				0	4			1	
		CSC Staff	2	21.	65	58.	5	4.5	1	15.	0	0	3.8	
			4	6		6			7	3			6	
6	The Ministry does not encourage the influence of external factors during the selection process.	PRS Staff	1	30.	25	47.	2	3.8	1	18.	0	0	3.8	
			6	2		2			0	9			9	
		HRM Staff	1	26.	26	57.	1	2.2	6	13.	0	0	3.9	
			2	7		8			3	3			8	
7	Check up reference is a criterion for selection to ascertain the quality of staff.	CSC Staff	2	22.	62	55.	6	5.4	1	16.	0	0	3.8	
			5	5		9			8	2			5	
		PRS Staff	1	22.	25	47.	6	11.	1	18.	0	0	3.7	
			2	6		2			3	0		9	4	
8	Qualification plays vital role in staff selection in Ministry of Education.	HRM Staff	9	20.	30	66.	4	8.9	2	4.4	0	0	4.0	
			0		7								2	
		CSC Staff	6	5.4	23	20.	4	3.6	5	50.	2	19.	2.4	
					7				6	5		2	8	1
9	The Ministry does not encourage the influence of external factors during the selection process.	PRS Staff	2	3.8	15	28.	0	0	2	47.	1	20.	2.4	
					3				5	2		1	8	7
		HRM Staff	0	0	17	37.	0	0	2	46.	7	15.	2.6	
					8				1	7		6	0	
10	Check up reference is a criterion for selection to ascertain the quality of staff.	CSC Staff	0	0	5	4.5	2	1.8	8	74.	2	18.	2.0	
									3	8		1	9	2
		PRS Staff	1	1.9	4	7.5	1	1.9	3	67.	1	20.	2.5	
									1	6		1	8	8
11	Qualification plays vital role in staff selection in Ministry of Education.	HRM Staff	2	4.4	4	8.9	1	2.2	3	66.	8	17.	2.1	
									0	7		8	6	
		CSC Staff	2	20.	53	47.	7	6.3	2	25.	0	0	3.6	
			3	7		7			8	2			4	
12	Qualification plays vital role in staff selection in Ministry of Education.	PRS Staff	1	35.	20	37.	1	1.9	1	24.	0	0	3.8	
			9	8		7			3	5			5	
		HRM Staff	1	37.	19	42.	0	0	8	17.	1	2.2	3.9	

				7	8		2				8			6
9	Physical fitness is considered in staff selection in Ministry of Education.	CSC Staff		2	19.	48	43.	9	8.1	3	27.	1	0.9	3.4
		PRS Staff		2	8		2			1	9			2
		HRM Staff		1	20.	22	41.	2	3.8	1	32.	1	1.9	3.4
				1	8		5			7	1			7
				1	35.	20	44.	2	4.4	7	15.	0	0	4.0
				6	6		4				6			0
10	All Divisional or Departmental heads are involved in the selection process.	CSC Staff		2	18.	66	59.	6	5.4	1	15.	2	1.8	3.7
		PRS Staff		0	0		5			7	3			7
		HRM Staff		1	26.	23	43.	4	7.5	1	20.	1	1.9	3.7
				4	4		4			1	8			2
				8	17.	30	66.	1	2.2	6	13.	0	0	3.9
					8		7				3			9
	Grand Mean													3.25

Table 2 shows the perceptions of stakeholders on selection process in State Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria. It revealed that all the items except items 2, 3, 6 and 7 were all agreed upon as ways stakeholders perceive selection process in State Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria. This was because they had response mean score higher than the instrument scale mean of 3.00. With the grand mean of 3.25 which is higher than the instrument mean of 3.00, this shows that majority of the respondents agreed that staff were selected based on area of specialization, but experience of applicant was not considered in staff selection in Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria.

Hypotheses

Hypothesis One: There is no significant difference in the perceptions of stakeholders on Application Procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria.

Table 3: Summary of One-Way ANOVA on the Perceptions of Stakeholders on Application Procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West, Nigeria

Variation	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F-ratio	P-Value
Between Groups	1.736	2	.868	0.98	0.38
Within Groups	181.987	206	.883		
Total	183.722	208			

P<0.05

Table 3 shows that the calculated Sig.(P) value of 0.38 is higher than 0.05 level of significant set for the study. Hence, the null hypothesis which states that there is no significant difference in the perceptions of stakeholders on

Application Procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria is hereby retained.

Hypothesis Two: There is no significant difference in the perceptions of stakeholders on the Selection Process in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria.

Table 4: Summary of One-Way ANOVA on the Perceptions of Stakeholders on Selection Process in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria

Variation	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F-ratio	P-Value
Between Groups	4.092	2	2.046	2.21	0.11
Within Groups	190.423	206	.924		
Total	194.515	208			

P<0.05

Table 4 shows that the calculated Sig.(P) value of 0.11 is higher than 0.05 level of significant set for the study. Hence, the null hypothesis which states that there is no significant difference in the perceptions of stakeholders on the Selection Process in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria is hereby retained.

Discussions

The findings of the research question one revealed that deadlines for applications were clearly stated, but applicants do not receive timely updates on the status of their applications from the Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria. This agrees with the result of hypothesis three which was retained, meaning that there is no significant difference in the perceptions of stakeholders on the Application Procedure in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria. The variable tested that p-value is 0.38 which is higher than 0.05 level of significant. In line with this finding, Adu and Nawangsari (2022) found that background checks and references to verify the information provided by applicants with call or send an official letter to close friends of the applicant or the applicant's family and the company where the applicant previously worked is very important. This, in the opinion of Adula and Kant (2022), is to ensure the information provided by the applicant is correct and appropriate. Also, Ahmad and Nur (2023) reported that recruiting process methodology employed significantly influences the number of applications received by the organization.

The findings of the research question two revealed that staff were selected based on area of specialization, but experience of applicant was not considered in staff selection in Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria. This agrees with the result of hypothesis four which was retained, meaning that there is no significant difference in the perceptions of stakeholders on the staff selection in State Ministries of Education in North West Zone, Nigeria. The variable tested that p-value is 0.11 which is higher than 0.05 level of significant. In line with this finding, Edih et al (2022) found that selection strategies had positive and significant effects on organizational management or performance. Ahmad and Nur (2023), Okoro and Ndema (2023), indicated that the recruitment process, especially selection, has a positive and significant impact on employee performance. Oyadiran et al (2023) revealed that there is positively significance effect of recruitment and selection process on organization performance. Also, Yusuf (2018) found that there was no adequate implementation of guidelines for selection of staff in the Ministry of Education in Nasarawa State. The findings further agreed with the finding of Adamu (2019) who revealed that the selection process ensures equality of opportunity and it is transparent from the outset to the end. In addition, Akyuz and Opusunju. (2019) found that there is a significant positive relationship between selection and the performance of employees

Conclusion

Based on the findings of the study, it was concluded that deadlines for applications were clearly stated, but applicants do not receive timely updates on the status of their applications from the Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria. With this, more attention should be given to selection procedures/strategies in the recruitment process since they help to get the right and qualified persons for the vacant jobs in the Ministry of Education. The selection of candidates should be anchored on merit, competence and similar job characteristic factors as they will improve employee's performance. The procedure for selection and placement of the would-be employees should be thorough, objective and devoid of sentiment.

Recommendations

In line with the research findings and conclusions, the study recommended that:

- i. State Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria should ensure that applicants receive timely updates on the status of their applications from the Ministries.
- ii. Experience of applicant should always be considered in staff selection in Ministries of Education in North-West, Nigeria.

References

- Adamu, A. Y. (2019). Selection and appointment of higher education leaders in Ethiopia: An assessment of implementation. *Bahir Dar Journal of Education*, 19 (1), 1-19.
- Adu, J; & Nawangsari, L. C. (2022). Build organizational citizenship behavior toward environment through organizational culture, organizational commitment and mediated self-efficacy. *International Journal of Indonesian Business Review*, 1(1), 1-10. <https://doi.org/10.54099/ijibr.v1i1.251>.
- Adula, M., & Kant, S. (2022). Examining entrepreneurship significant factors affecting the performance of MSE's in Ethiopia, horn of Africa. *International Journal of Law Policy and Governance*, 1(1), 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.54099/ijlpg.v1i1.282>
- Ahmad, F. & Nur, I. (2023). The impact of the recruitment process on employee performance. *Advances in Human Resource Management Research*, 1(2), 55 – 65. Retrieved from DOI: <https://doi.org/10.60079/ahrmr.v1i2.75>.
- Akyuz, M; & Opusunju, M. I. (2019). Effect of recruitment and selection on performance of Diamond Bank Plc, Abuja. *International Journal of Economics, Business and Management Research*, 3 (8): 133-153. www.ijebmr.com
- Charles, G. I. & Aligba, S. O. (2017). *Fundamental issues in educational research* (2nd Edition). Makurdi, Eagle Prints Nigeria.
- Edih, U; Onoriode, O. H; & Faghawari, N. (2022): Selection strategies and organizational management in the private sector: Applying the matching theory in the recruitment process. *Konfrontasi Journal: Culture, Economy and Social Changes*, 9 (3), 421-431 Available

at DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33258/konfrontasi2.v9i3.235>. It can also be assessed at <http://www.konfrontasi.net/index.php/konfrontasi2>.

- Gold, J. & Bratton, J. (2021). *Human Resource Management: Theory and practice* (4th ed). Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan. 239–273
- Muna, F; Azam, F. S. M; & Ahmad, A. (2020). Recruitment and selection practices in the Maldivian Civil Service Organization. *International Journal of Scientific and Technological Research*, 9 (9), 389-396 www.ijstr.org
- Munaty, S; & Setiasih, Y. R. D. (2022). The effect of recruitment, selection and training process on employee performance pt. budiman sejahtera development. *International Journal of Management and Digital Business*, 1(1), 37-51. <https://journal.adpebi.com/index.php/ijmdb>
- Oaya, Z. C. T; Ogbu, J. O; Ojo, G. R. (2017). Impact of recruitment and selection strategy on employees' performance: A study of three selected manufacturing companies in Nigeria. *International Journal of Innovation and Economic Development*, 3(3), 32-42. URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.18775/ijied.1849-7551-7020.2015.33.2003>
- Okoro, B. C; & Ndema, S. C. (2023). Effect of recruitment and selection on performance of First Bank Plc, Enugu Metropolis. *International Journal of Advances in Engineering and Management (IJAEM)*, 5 (6), 638-645 www.ijaem.net.
- Oyadiran, P. A; Musa, F. I; & Gunbiade, A. K. (2023). Effects of recruitment and selection process on performance in organisations. *International Journal of Human Resource Management and Humanities (IJHRMH)*, 1(1), 1-26 <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/372992916>
- Yusuf, F. (2018). Evaluation of the procedure for recruitment, selection, placement and promotion of staff in the Ministry of Education in Nasarawa State, Nigeria. Unpublished M.Ed Dissertation, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria.