

Relationship Between Quality of Teacher Research Publications and Managerial Effectiveness in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria

***¹Bello Musa and ²Sani Dantani Manga**

^{*1}Department of Educational Foundations, Faculty of Education, Sokoto State University, Sokoto State, Nigeria. **Email:** bello.musa@ssu.edu.ng

²Department of Educational Foundations, Faculty of Education and Extension Services, Usmanu Danfodiyo University, Sokoto

Abstract

This study investigated the relationship between quality of teachers' research publications and managerial effectiveness in state universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria. The research design for this study was a correlational design. The population comprised all academic staff and their head of Departments Deans and Directors which amounts to 2674 among the eight (8) State Universities within the Zone. The sample size selection of 333 out of 2,674 was based on Research Advisors, the researcher applied proportionate sampling to draw up the sample while random sampling was used in selecting the respondents. The study used two set of questionnaires for data collections. The two instruments were self-designed questionnaires titled: Teacher Productivity Questionnaire (TPQ) and Managerial Effectiveness Questionnaire (MEQ). The questionnaires were validated by expert using content validity. The reliability of the instruments was obtained using test, re-test method and reliability indexes of 0.78 and 0.75 were obtained respectively. The researcher employed descriptive and inferential statistics for data analysis. Mean score was used to answer research questions with decision mean 3.0 as moderate extent of agreement. Pearson Product Moment Correlation Co-efficient was used to test hypothesis. The study discovered that, there was significant relationship between quality of teacher research publications and managerial effectiveness in State Universities in North Western zone, Nigeria. In conclusion, the correlation between impactful research publications and managerial effectiveness highlights the importance of a research-driven environment in universities. Therefore, the study recommended that, university management in collaboration with the Ministry for Higher Education should shoulder the responsibility of publishing higher quality research by teachers in both national and international Journals. This will serve as encouragement for the younger generation of scholar who may have financial challenges in publishing their research work.

Keywords: Quality of Teacher Research Publications, and Managerial Effectiveness

Introduction

The main primary responsibilities of academic staff are teaching, conducting researches and community service that support the institutional mission. Therefore, research publication is one of the primary responsibilities of university teachers. Research publication refers to the process of making concluded scientific information publically available and allow the rest of the academic audience to evaluate the quality of the research (Ayeni, & Fakunle, 2020). Universities are one of the places that the public rely up on to provide solutions to their problems through research conducted by their academic staff. For example, during COVID-19 pandemic many academic staff of the universities engaged in research with aim of providing solution to the problem. The quality of the university system is determined by the way staff in the system are being encouraged to introduce new innovations in handling and preventing societal problems through their research (Anyanwun, 2020). Universities as formal organizations for knowledge generation and its transmission to society have been central societal development (Jega, 2007).

Manager by nature are individuals responsible for coordinating, directing and evaluating the activities of the employee team in professional setting. Managerial effectiveness refers to how well a manager accomplished the organizational goals of an organization by using available resources efficiently and coordinating the efforts of the members of the organization (Nwokocha, & Hafsat, 2020). It considers how well they set goals, make decision, communicate effectively, inspire and motivate their team, delegate task and handle conflict. Managerial effectiveness refers to a manager ability to achieve the organizational goals and balance employee expectations and development (Zhentao, & Lingling, 2022). An effective manager must ensure work is completed efficiently and on time and also take into consideration organizational and employee progress.

The main thrust of this study is to examine the relationship between the quality of teacher research publications and managerial effectiveness in State Universities North Western Zone, Nigeria. This is because quality of teacher research publications plays significant role in managerial effectiveness of the universities.

Theoretical Framework

The theoretical basis of this study is based on Fredrick Taylor, Scientific Management Theory cited by Manga (2015) which postulated the following principles:

- I. The development of a true science to replace the intuitive method of doing the work of the organization. He felt that for every task, one best way should be determined
- II. The scientific selection of workmen i.e., scientifically selecting the best person for the job, training him thoroughly in the task, and procedure to be followed, and giving him a job to which he is best suited physically as well as intellectually.
- III. The scientific education and development of workmen.
- IV. The intimate friendly cooperation between management and the workmen to ensure that the work is being done according to established standards and procedures (principles).

This theory is highly related to the study in providing information that educational organizations can be productive when all the stakeholder in the institutions are recognized and their contributions acknowledged. This study highly attached to the scientific management theory as the theory give much emphasis on how to improved productivity of the organizations for the attainment of organizational gaols. Through their productivity, the managers expect them to be loyalists, hardworking, efficient, and productive. Wherever this is done, the predetermined organizational goals can be achieved. The goals of the institution always appear as the pivot of all decision-making and productivity.

The study is also based on Principles of Administration Management Theory by Henri Fayol Administrative Management Theory can be described as an approach to management and increasing organizational structure and human bahavior. Fayol theory is grounded in the five functions that represent management which include the following as cited by Scott, (2022):

- I. Initiative This refers to the level of freedom employee should have to carry out their responsibilities without being forced or order.

- II. Equity: This principle implies everyone in the organization should be treated equally and that it should be an environment of kindness.
- III. Scalar Chain: This principle says there should be a chain of supervisors from the top level of management to the lower level and that communication generally flows from top to bottom.
- IV. Unity of direction: This principle asserts that there should be only one manager per department who is in charge of coordinating the group activity to attain a single goal.
- V. Division of work: This principle says the overall action of management should be divided and that team members should be given responsibilities based on their skills and interest to make them more effective and efficient.

This theory is highly related to current study which ascertain that teacher research publications has relation on managerial effectiveness in the university system. The principles of the theory are highly attached to the study as they give emphasis on how the organizational goals could be achieved.

Review of Related Empirical Studies

Based on the variables under study some of the related empirical studies were reviewed which include:

Okon (2020) conducted a study on School Variables and Teachers' Productivity in Secondary Schools in Akpabuyo Local Government Area, Cross River State, Nigeria. The research study examined the school climate and its influence on teachers' productivity in Secondary Schools in Akpabuyo Local Government Area of Cross River State, Nigeria. The researcher adopted a survey design for the study. A sample of 150 out of a population of 206 teachers was randomly selected for the study. A 24-item questionnaire based on a 4- point Likert scale was constructed to elicit information for the study. The hypotheses formulated were tested at 0.05 alpha level and 147 degrees of freedom using one-way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) statistics. The result showed that there is a significant influence of the motivation of teachers and a significant influence of the Principal's administrative style on teacher's productivity. It was recommended that the motivation of teachers should be given top priority by the authorities concerned if teacher's productivity must

improve. An effective principal's administrative style should also be encouraged for enhanced teacher productivity.

This study is highly related to the current study because the focuses area of the study is on School Variables and Teachers' Productivity in Secondary Schools in Akpabuyo Local Government Area, Cross River State, Nigeria while the current study investigates the relationship between quality of teacher research publications and managerial effectiveness in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria. The populations of the two studies are different the previous study focuses on secondary education level while the current study is focused on tertiary education level. The geographical location of the two studies are also different.

However, Abiodun (2020) conducted a study on the relationship between managerial skills, personality characteristics, and administrative staff effectiveness in the University of Ibadan, Nigeria. The study employed descriptive survey research design and the population of the study comprised all the administrative staff of the University of Ibadan. The sample size consisted of 225 administrative staff selected from nine departments of the university. Three research questions were raised and one hypothesis was formulated using simple percentages, frequency counts, mean, and multiple regression an instrument titled "Managerial Skills, Personality Characteristics and Administrative Staff Effectiveness Questionnaire" (MSPCASEQ) was used to elicit relevant data for the study. The reliability coefficient of the instrument was ensured through the test re-test method of testing reliability and the co-efficient value of 0.84 was obtained. Prominent among the findings from the study revealed that, there was a joint contribution among managerial skills, personality characteristics, and administrative staff effectiveness at $F(6,218) = 15.444, p < 0.05$ and based on the findings, it was recommended that administrative staff should be exposed further by management to pieces of training and seminars, all aimed at improving their level of effectiveness and to also maintain or sustain the prevalent managerial skills, and learn new skills to improve administrative staff service delivery and positive attitude to work; the use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) should be fully deployed or engaged to channel effective communication between the top management and administrative staff.

This study is highly related to the current study because they both focuses on managerial effectiveness. The geographical location of the two studies are

different. The previous study focuses on only one state in South-West, Nigeria.

Statement of the Problem

Universities are ranked globally based on the qualities of research publications of academic staff of the universities among other criteria. State Universities in North Western Zone were usually ranked extremely low globally (Anyanwu, 2020). These universities struggle with limited funding, outdated research facilities, and insufficient access to current academic literature. This directly impacts the ability of teachers to conduct rigorous research and publish their findings in reputable journals. The researcher observed that one of the major problems in the context of teacher research publication is the politicization of research grants provided by bodies like Tetfund (Tertiary Education Trust Fund).

Ogunode (2020) lamented that instead of awarding research grants based on merit, academic excellence, or the potential for significant contributions to knowledge. Some management of the universities engage in nepotism and favoritism. These institutions often allocate research grants to individuals who are close associates, loyalists, or even relatives in service or individuals with influence within the university hierarchy. These instances hamper the progress of research and discourage teachers from actively engaging in research activities. Without necessary support and resources, teacher research publication remains constrained, ultimately affecting the novelty and quality researches in the universities. However, Ogunode, (2020), stated that as a result of poor management and an ineffective style of administration, a lot of programs or activities are not carried out in our institutions such as the provision of grants for research and publications, staff welfare activities neglected, no adequate control of staff and students. Therefore, this study assessed the relationship between the quality of teachers' research publications and managerial effectiveness in state universities in North West, Nigeria so that appropriate measures can be taken by the relevant stakeholders.

Objectives of the Study

This study intends to achieve the following objectives:

- I. To examine the quality of teacher research publications in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria.

- II. To find out the level of managerial effectiveness in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria.
- III. To find out the relationship between quality of teacher research publications and managerial effectiveness in State Universities North Western Zone, Nigeria.

Research Questions

This research hopes to provide an answer to the following research question:

- I. What is the quality of teacher's research publications in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria?
- II. What is the level of managerial effectiveness in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria?

Research Hypothesis

The following Hypothesis was formulated and tested:

- H₀₁** There is no significant relationship between the quality of teacher research publications and managerial effectiveness in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria.

Methodology

The research design for this study was a correlational design. The correlational design consists of a simple association or relation between or among the variables (Creswell, 2012). The population of this study comprises all academic staff and their head of Departments Deans and Directors which amounts to 2,674 as the total population of the participants. The sample size selection of 333 was based on the Research Advisor (2006) table for determining sample size. The researcher applied a Proportionate sample in drawing up the sample while a random sampling technique was used in selecting the participants. To collect the data for this study two sets of questionnaires were used which were researcher-designed questionnaires, titled: Teacher Productivity Questionnaire (TPQ) and Managerial Effectiveness Questionnaire (MEQ). The questionnaires were structured in such a way that it requested the participant to tick relevant option from the given five (5) point Likert scale as Very High Extent 5 points; High Extent 4

points; Moderate Extent 3 points; Low Extent 2 points; and Very Low Extent 1 point.

The instruments were validated by a team of experts in Educational Management from the Faculty of Education and Extension Services Usmanu Danfodiyo University, Sokoto. The reliability of the instruments was obtained through the test and re-test method and reliability indexes 0.78 and 0.75 were obtained respectively. The responses to the questionnaire were collected and processed. The researcher employed descriptive and inferential statistics to analyze the data. A mean score was used to answer the responses of the participants to the research questions with the decision mean of 3.0 indicating a moderate extent of agreement. While any mean score below 3.0 was considered as low extent of agreement. Pearson Product Moment Correlation Co-efficient was used to test the hypothesis. The data were processed with the use of Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS).

Data Presentation and Analysis

The results are presented in tabular forms and interpreted using descriptive and inferential statistics. Mean scores were used in answering all research questions. In so doing, it is pertinent to note that the responses were graded as Very High Extent 5 points; High Extent 4 points; Moderate Extent 3 points; Low Extent 2 points; and Very Low Extent 1 point, which were used in analyzing all the responses. While inferential statistics was used in testing all null hypotheses of the study.

Research Question One: What is the quality of teacher's research publications in State Universities in North Western Zone? The following Table 1 is the respondents' responses on the extent of quality of teacher's research publications in state universities in North Western Zone Nigeria

Table 1: Teacher Productivity Responses

S/N	Quality of Teacher's Research Publications	Mean	Std. Dev	Rating	Decision
1	Teachers in my University publish articles locally in their departmental and faculty-based journals	2.94	0.74	LE	Unsatisfactory
2	Teachers published quality articles in their national Association Journal and Book of Readings	2.98	0.64	LE	Unsatisfactory
3	Teachers published in journals across universities in six geo-political zone in Nigeria	3.47	1.43	ME	Satisfactory
4	Teachers published quality textbooks in their fields that are peer-reviewed for used at tertiary level of education	3.44	1.52	ME	Satisfactory
5	Teachers publish in international off-show journals published outside Nigeria	3.97	1.55	HE	Satisfactory
6	Teachers articles in journals are cross-referenced and indexed with the digital object identified number	2.94	1.31	LE	Unsatisfactory
7	Teachers publish in online Journals articles in Google Scholar, and Research Gate	2.89	1.25	LE	Unsatisfactory
8	Teachers publish in first and second quartile journals	2.48	0.80	LE	Unsatisfactory
9	Teachers publish work that is free from plagiarism	2.49	0.97	LE	Unsatisfactory
10	Teachers publish good teaching manual, monographs, and technical reports	2.48	0.65	LE	Unsatisfactory
Weight Mean (\bar{x})		3.08	1.06	ME	Satisfactory

Source: Field Work (2023)

N=333, Cut off Mean=3.00

Key: Vey High Extent = VHE

High Extent = HE

Moderate Extent = ME

Low Extent = LE

Very Low Extent = VLE

Table 1 reveals that the respondents indicated average affirmation that there is moderate extent in quality of teacher's research publications. This is evident by an affirmed response of items one and two of the table indicating that low extent of agreement with 2.74 and 2.78, respectively. While items three, four, and five indicated a moderate extent of agreement with 3.47, 3.44, and 3.77 respectively. Item six, seven, eight, and nine, indicated low extents of agreement with 2.94, 2.89, 2.48, and 2.49, respectively. However, item ten of the table indicated a low extent with 2.48. The total points of the table indicate

that, to a moderate extent, teacher’s research publications in state Universities in North West zone are of moderate quality.

Research Question Two: What is the level of managerial effectiveness in state universities in North Western Zone Nigeria?

The respondents’ responses on the level of effectiveness of school administrators in state universities in North Western zone Nigeria is presented in Table 2

Table 2: Level of Effectiveness of School Administrators in State Universities in North Western Zone of Nigeria

S/N	Item Statement	Mean	Std. Dev	Rating	Decision
1	Management in my university has set goals for higher quality research by their academic staff	2.90	0.85	[LE	Unsatisfactory
2	Management encourage Faculties and Departments in organising academic gathering like conferences, workshops, seminar series among others	3.33	1.40	ME	Satisfactory
3	Management set up a disciplinary committee for maintaining law and order and good conduct	3.74	1.52	ME	Satisfactory
4	Management has Examination Monitoring Committee to ensure that teachers give quality supervision of students during examinations	3.89	0.57	ME	Satisfactory
5	Management clearly state the terms of reference to guide the action of individuals and various authority for protection of teachers rights	2.78	1.21	LE	Unsatisfactory
6	Management appoints a chairman for each committee to lead and direct the activity of each committee	3.98	1.33	ME	Satisfactory
7	All faculties, departments, and units are pursuing uniform goals of protecting teachers rights and ensure their managerial effectiveness	2.98	0.67	LE	Unsatisfactory
8	Management ensures that all faculties, and departments operate with synergy toward identifying and addressing challenges in the protection of teachers' rights and ensuring teacher productivity	2.17	1.45	[LE	Unsatisfactory
9	Management ensure that Deans, Directors, Head of Departments supervised the activities of committees and individuals towards protecting the rights of teachers and maintaining teacher productivity	3.40	1.76	ME	Satisfactory
10	Management ensure that Directors, Deans, Head of Departments motivate, guide, mentor	4.11	1.38	HE	Satisfactory

Relationship Between Quality of Teacher Research Publications and Managerial Effectiveness in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria

and evaluate the activities of staff, committees, and teachers towards enforcement of teachers rights and higher productivity				y
Weight Mean (\bar{x})	3.32	1.14	ME	Satisfactory

Source: Field Work (2023)

N=333, Cut off Mean=3.00

Key: Very High Extent = VHE

High Extent = HE

Moderate Extent = ME

Low Extent = LE

Very Low Extent = VLE

Table 2 reveals that the respondents indicated average confirmation that there is a moderate extent in the level of effectiveness of school administrators. This is evident by an affirmed response of item one of the table indicating that low extent with 2.90. The items two, three, and four of the table indicated the moderate extent with 3.33, 3.74, and 3.89, respectively. Item five of the table shows a 2.78 mean score which is a low extent. Item six indicated 3.98 which is a moderate extent. Item seven and eight indicated low extents with 2.98 and 2.17 respectively. Item nine of the table shows the mean score of 3.41 which is moderate extent. Item ten of the table indicated 4.11 which is a high extent.

Hypothesis Testing

The following null hypothesis was tested below:

Hypothesis One: There is no significant relationship between the quality of teachers' research publications and managerial effectiveness in State Universities in the North Western Zone.

This hypothesis was tested by subjecting the quality of teachers' research publications and managerial effectiveness scores to a Pearson r-test analysis as shown in Table 3.

Table 3: Relationship between Quality of Teachers' Research Publications and Managerial Effectiveness

Variables	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	r-Cal	p-Value	Decision
Research Publications	333	40.56	9.313	0.344	0.000	Hypothesis Rejected
Managerial Effectiveness	333	73.68	11.724			

Source: Field Work (2023)

From the result of Table 3, the quality of teachers’ research publications and managerial effectiveness were positively related and significant, $r(331) = 0.344$, $p = 0.000$. This indicates a significant relationship between the quality of teachers’ research publications and managerial effectiveness because the p -value is less than the 0.05 level of significance. Therefore, H_{01} which states that there is no significant relationship between the quality of teachers’ research publications and managerial effectiveness was rejected.

Summary of the Findings

Based on the research findings, the following findings are summarized:

- I. Quality of teachers’ research publications in state Universities in the North West zone was found at moderate level.
- II. The level of managerial effectiveness in state universities North Western zone, Nigeria was found at moderate extent.
- III. The study found that there is significant relationship between quality of teacher research publications and managerial effectiveness in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria.

Discussion

This section intends to discuss the findings of this study concerning the findings of previous studies one after the other as follows:

The first finding indicates that the quality of teachers’ research publications is an indication of managerial effectiveness in State Universities in the North Western Zone. This finding agreed with Irtwange and Orsaah (2009), who reported that research effort/output, and publication are among the criteria for promoting academic staff in Nigerian universities. Therefore, academic staff must conduct research and make their findings public even for the purpose of promotion. This has been explained by the responses of the respondents in

Table 1 item three, four and five which indicate satisfactory for academic staff in publishing their researches in reputable journals with very little they earned as salary. However, some of the responses of the respondents in Table 1 indicate that academic staff are lacking in publishing their articles with some journal within the university maybe because of the criteria used by some universities of taking only two to four articles from journal during promotion. However, item six, seven, eight, nine and ten of Table 1 indicate unsatisfactory on academic staff publishing text books, teaching manuals, or sending their articles to international journals like first quartile journal which maybe as result of cost implications.

The second finding revealed that the level of managerial effectiveness was at moderate extent in state universities North Western zone, Nigeria. The finding is in line with Chepkonga (2015), who discovered that managerial effectiveness plays a significant role in ensuring continued existence, development, and adaptableness of organizations and that it is the major issue in the administration because every organization desires to achieve the target goals effectively and efficiently. Consequently, the finding agreed with Sonnentag, Volmer, and Spsychala (2010), who revealed that the level of performance of teaching staff and non-teaching staff could determine the performance of the university and it could also determine the level which the university target goals are achieved or accomplished.

The third finding found that there is significant relationship between quality of research publication and managerial effectiveness in State Universities in North Western Zone, Nigeria. The finding is supported by Ogunode (2020), who reported that one of the pillars that promote managerial effectiveness in the universities is the level of research output of their teachers. However, the finding agreed with Irtwange & Orsaah (2009), who pointed out that, the assessment of university teachers in the university of Agriculture, Makurdi (as other universities in Nigeria) is normally done concerning an absolute standard of performance or levels of output in six major areas: qualification, teaching/cognate experience, contribution to university and community, publications, current research/extension and administrative experience. Consequently, the finding also supported by Ayeni and Fakunle (2020), who reported that teachers' professional development refers to the statutory duties that are performed for the development of their field such as the writing of papers for the annual conference, review of the content program, curriculum delivery. However, the finding agreed with Tess (2003) who pointed out that

educational managers must motivate academic staff to use their creativity and initiatives as needed in making their contribution, towards the achievement of university target goals.

Conclusion

In conclusion, this study examines the relationship between quality teacher research publications and managerial effectiveness in state universities within the North Western zone of Nigeria. The correlation between impactful research publications and managerial effectiveness highlights the importance of a research-driven environment in universities. However, the study interestingly demonstrates that, among these factors, teacher research publication holds greater relevance in assessing managerial effectiveness, underscoring the critical influence of pedagogy and classroom dynamics on the overall educational landscape. These insights offer valuable implications for educational policymakers and administrators, emphasizing the need to provide supportive mechanism for teachers and, consequently, elevate the academic standards of state universities in the North Western region and beyond.

Recommendations

The study made the following recommendations which include:

- I. State Government should make a sign of commitments by releasing enough fund, infrastructural facilities, providing updated research facilities to the universities. This will help the academic staff in engaging the rigorous researches that may help in solving the societal problems. It will also reduce the over dependency of our society on foreign countries in providing solution to some of our problems.

- II. University management in collaboration with the Ministry for Higher Education should shoulder the responsibility of publishing higher quality researches conducted by the teachers both national and international Journals. This will serve as encouragement for the younger generation scholar who may have financial challenges in publishing their research findings.

- III. University management should understand that, quality of teacher research publications is one of the important area that may help in achieving the university educational goals both nationally and internationally.

Reference

- Abiodun, O. O. (2020). Examined the relationship between managerial skills, personality characteristics, and administrative staff effectiveness in the University of Ibadan, Nigeria. *Journal of Education Review*. 12. (2), 121-134.
- Anyanwu, O. M. (2020). Staff personnel management and university effectiveness in SouthWest, Nigeria. *International Journal of Educational Administration and Policy Studies*. 3. (7), 140-159, November, 2020. <http://doi.org/10.5897/>.
- Ayeni, A. J., & Fakunle, A. F. (2020). Teamwork management and teachers' productivity in secondary schools in Ondo Central Senatorial District of Ondo State, Nigeria. Available online at <http://www.academicjournals.org/ERR2> ISSN 1990-3839 © 2009 Academic Journals.
- Chepkonga, M. E. (2015). Issues and problems in the establishment of National Judicial Council under the 1999 constitution. *Calabar Law Journal.*, 3. (2) 101-112.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research*. Phoenix Color Corp.
- Irtwange, S. V. & Orsaah, S. (2009). Impact of management style on performance indicators of academic staff performance with the University of Agriculture, Makurdi as a case study. *Educational Research and Review*. 4. (12), pp. 602-615.
- Jega, M. A. (2007). *Democracy, good governance, and development in Nigeria*. Ibadan: Spectrum Book Limited.
- Manga, S. D. (2015). *Introduction to Educational Management*. Sokoto, Usmanu Danfodiyo University Press.

- Nwokocha, J. & Hafsat, U. I. (2020). Neo-liberalization of higher education: Impact on institutional leadership, policy, and management of higher education in Nigeria. In N. P.
- Ogunode, N. J. (2020). Administration of public universities in Nigeria: Problems and Solutions. *Journal Sinesthesia*, 10. (2). 110-119.
- Okon, E. A. (2020). School variables and teachers' productivity in secondary school in Akpabuyo Local Government Area, Cross River State, Nigeria. Research Advisor, (2006). *Table of population sample*.
- Scott, W. (2022). Seven types of workplace management theories. Retrieved from: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/329014139> on 22/2/2022, 4:34pm.
- Sonnentag, S. Volmer, J. and Spychala, A. (2010). Job performance. *Sage Handbook of Organizational Behaviour*. 1. (5) pp. 427-447.
- Tess, S. M. H. (2003) *Personnel administration towards optimum productivity*. Ibadan Awemark industrial printers.
- Werang, I. B. (2014). An examination of the right to freedom of expression in Nigeria. Retrieved from: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/329014139> on 22/2/2022, 4:34pm.
- Zhentao E. D. & Lingling M. K. (2022). *Race, racism, and development: interrogating history, discourse and practice*. Zed Books, London, New York.